Governance Mechanisms in Divided Societies

LEARNING FROM & USING GLOBAL EXPERIENCES

Naresh .C . Singh

INTRODUCTION

- BIAS : Paper looks at the subject from the standpoint of international development co-operation

- OUTLINE: The paper seeks to describe:

- Relevant concepts and definitions

- Challenges to learning and using lessons generated elsewhere

Outline cont'd

- **An approach to resolving some of the challenges (CIDA-FoF study)**
- **A more general framework for learning from and using international experiences drawing from the international development experience-** *a combined sustainable livelihoods //systems approach*
- **Applying this approach to Guyana as an illustration of its practical utility**

What's the issue ?

- PROBLEM: To accommodate the interests and identities of different individuals , groups, and individuals within groups in a manner that promotes prosperity, equity and justice.

- SOLUTION: Promote democracy and open markets.

- PROBLEM: Democracy is the worst form of governance in practice , until you try the others (Churchill) +Rise of market dominant minority

Governance and Conflict : Concepts from Int. Dev Co-op.

- **Governance and the World Bank 1989**
- **UNDP (1995) definition :exercise of political , economic and administrative authority in the management of a country's affairs at all levels. Governance comprises the complex mechanisms processes and institutions through which citizens and groups articulate their interests, mediate their differences and exercise their legal rights and obligations. Good governance is effective,participatory, transparent, accountable, equitable and promotes rule of law**

In practice what did UNDP do in governance (special circs)

- **Reconciliation of opposing parties and the establishment of the legitimacy of the state**
- **The reconciliation and reconstitution of fractured societies**
- **Recreating institutions of govt for ensuring political ,economic and social stability**
- **Re-establishing confidence in the institutions of government**
- **Re-creating enabling env. for econ. activity**

UNDP activities in countries with special circumstances cont'd

- **Fostering democratic institutions of Govt and capacity to manage elections**

- **Strenghtening capacity to ensure adherence to international human rights norms and standards**

- **Public administration and Civil Service Reforms**

CIDA/ Canada

- **Definition similar to UNDP**
- **POLICY OBJECTIVES to STRENGHTEN:**
- **Popular participation in decision-making**
- **Democratic institutions**
- **The public sector to promote the effective, honest and accountable exercise of power**
- **Capacity to protect rights and security**
- **The will of leaders to respect rights, rule democratically and govern effectively**

CIDA's Current Support to Governance

- **HRDG one of 6 priorities set by GOC for CIDA**
- **Second largest in disbursements after basic human needs (200-300 projects of 200-300 M/year)**
- **Follows local priorities- chosen in partnerships**
- **Local empowerment- elections, legislative, decentralization (20-25%), civil society (12-15%), human rights (15%), child protection (5-7%)**
- **Public sector institutions- Policy, regulatory programs, capacity (30-35%)**
- **Conflict/human security/peace building(additional)**
- **See details at www.acdi-cida.gc.ca/governance**

Tools used by US in "aiding democracy abroad"

- **Diplomatic measures as carrots and sticks**

- **Economic sanctions and rewards**

- **Military means**

- **Democracy aid: elections,political parties, constitutions, judiciaries,local govt, police, trade-unions, media , NGO's.   (Total : US$165M in 1991 to US$637M IN 1999.) (Carrothers 1999.)**

OECD/DAC

- **Conflict prevention means prevention of violent disputes.Non-violent conflict is a normal part of society**

- **Ministerial Statement(2001): We will strive to increase coherence among our our policies- :trade, finance and investment, foreign affairs and defence, and development co-operation that impact on conflict prevention**

- **Conflict prevention is an integral part of the quest to reduce poverty**

- **Business can help actively prevent conflict**

Definition (lesson learned)

Governance refers to the following:

- ➢ **The steering of societies and organizations to achieve desired and national objectives and goals**
- ➢ **The setting of rules for the exercise of power, including who has access to political power, how those in power deal with those who are not, how those in power are held accountable**
- ➢ **The capacity of the state to organize social and economic activity according to rules, and to enforce compliance with those rules**
- ➢ **Mechanisms and institutional arrangements for articulating the interests of citizens and their involvement in decision-making processes**

Private Sector Side

- **Corporate Social responsibility**
- **Ethical behavior**
- **Environmental responsibility**
- **Respect for labor standards and equity issues**
- **Community partnerships for conflict management and poverty reduction**

Civil Society and Media

- **Capacity and space to self-organize to rebuild trust, shared values , common vision, settle disputes manage conflict etc…**

- **To hold government accountable**

- **MEDIA: Free ,responsible ,informed and analytical.**

Governance and its relation to other concepts and activities

Level	Activity	Concept
Meta	Politics	Governance
Macro	Policy	Policy-Making
Meso	Program	Public Admin
Micro	Project	Management

Operational Aspects

PowerAspect	Governance Focus	Program Concern	Institutional Issue
Articulation	Self-Organisation	Ownership	Empowerment
Mobilization	Social Capital	Capability	Civic Engagement
Distribution	Social Space	Access	Pluralism
Confirmation	Strength	Rights	Rule of Law

Learning Lessons in this Maze: Challenges & Contradictions

- **Unless the domain can be bounded : lessons cannot be learned/ best practices cannot be identified .**

- **Learning lessons is one thing, using them effectively out of context is quite another.**

- **Huge literature on lessons learned but little on what lesson was tried where, with what results, what adaptations were necessary, what worked better : lessons on process, tools, techniques , structural changes, triggers, actors ……?**

Challenges & Contradictions cont'd

- **Inherent contradiction :more contextual details more sense , but less generalized applicability**
- **Lessons from the past are being applied in the present/future in an age of rapid change**
- **We extract the generalities , for use elsewhere leaving behind the contextual factors responsible for success in the1st case**
- **Lessons learned are time frozen snap shots to be used in fast moving unpredictable situations (imagine speeding up some still photos to make a movie: what a blurred mess would result!)**

Some lessons learned

- **This conference will discuss about 25 country cases from Africa, Asia , Middle East , Latin America and the Caribbean therefore no need for much details now …just a few illustrations:**

- **Moving directly from struggle into dialogue rarely successful. Some determining influence is required to alter the fundamental aims , perceptions or attitudes of the key actors such as a change in military balance, death of a senior leader etc.(UNDP 2001)**

Lessons Learned Cont'd

- **Rarely if ever have natural disasters or famines made a sufficient difference to change attitudes at the negotiating table (exception Mozambique)**

- **Many existing conflict management tools were constructed during and in response to world wars and the cold war.These narrow containment-oriented strategies of coercion and crisis management are arthritic, inflexible and increasingly impotent against a wave of intra-state, identity driven, deep rooted conflicts. (IDEA 1998)**

From lessons learned to model building(escalation/de-escalation)

- IDEA'S 4 stage conflict model:

- 1)<u>Discussion stage</u>: Parties disagree but are still able to work together. Direct debate and discussion. Perceptions reasonably benign , have modicum of trust and respect.

- 2)<u>Polarization Stage</u>: Mutual perceptions have hardened. Communication more indirect.Respect replaced by perception that other side is unreliable Shift from co-operative decision making to competitive negtiation

4 STAGE MODEL CONT'D

- **3)Segregation stage: Communication now restricted to the issuance of threats. Mutual mistrust and disrespect.Opposing side is viewed as embodiment of evil. Outcome is viewed as zero-sum or winner takes all**

- **4)Destruction stage:All out antagonism. Direct violence or complete silence. Resolution seen as dependent on complete destruction of other side.**

Practical approaches to using lessons learned

- **One practical approach to solving the conundrum is the CIDA - Forum of Federations (Toronto) study which begins with**

- **defining a typological problematique (in this case Governance Options in Ethnically Divided Societies)**

- **identifies the key categories of possible relevant lessons such as :**

- **the nature of ethnicity as it relates to the state ;**

CIDA-FoF Study cont'd

- **Power Sharing (constitutional and non-constitutional and combinations of these), including pre-requisites for effective power sharing.**
- **Wealth sharing(the broad range of assets available and latent)**
- **Electoral Systems, majority, PR etc.**
- **Human rights instruments (minorities rights)**
- **Law and Justice(composition of police force etc)**

Possible Country Examples

- **ETHNICITY : Mauritius, Fiji, Malaysia , Guyana, Suriname, Mali, Nigeria, India, Ethiopia**

- **CONSTITUTIONAL STRUCTURES : UK, South Africa, Russia, Malaysia, India, Ethiopia ,Bosnia , Mauritius**

- **WEALTH SHARING: Canada, Australia, Germany , India , South Africa**

Possible Country Examples (cont'd)

- **ELECTORAL SYSTEMS : South Africa, UK**

- **HUMAN RIGHTS INSTRUMENTS : Bosnia , Canada , South Africa**

- **LAW and JUSTICE : Bosnia , Mauritius, Spain , Brazil , Canada.**

Using the lessons learned

- **Conduct any supplementary studies that could be necessary e.g a review of lessons learned in the area of dialogue techniques in this typology of country contexts**

- **Select lessons down to regional and sub-regional levels e.g Guyana , Surinam , Trinidad and Tobago**

- **For regions/sub-regions work with appropriate political bodies e.g ComSec, Caricom, OAS…**

Towards a Global Framework for learning and action

- **Elements from International Development Co-operation include shift from project to sector wide or program approach; emphasis on local ownership and leadership; human development & rights based approaches; assets and livelihoods**

- **Challenges to be addressed include complexity (many interacting variables with large degrees of freedom, uncertainty, multi-level interactions including individuals within groups(holarchies), economics and game theory to co-operation**

Complex Adaptive Systems Approach

- **Vulnerability Context: multi-level**
- **Assets Analysis (human, social ,natural , physical and economic)**
- **Use systems thinking to link policies , institutions and processes to vulnerability and assets**
- **Use double loop learning(learning how to learn)**

Assets

- **Human assets**
  - Knowledge
  - Skills
  - Creativity
  - Adaptive strategies

- **Social assets**
  - Governance
  - Decision making power
  - Community
  - Culture

- **Natural assets**
  - Land/soil
  - Water
  - Air
  - Flora and Fauna

- **Physical assets**
  - Buildings
  - Roads
  - Machinery
  - Crops/livestock

SYSTEMS PRACTICE

- **BOUNDARY JUDGEMENTS**

- **DEEPENING SYSTEMIC APPRECIATION**

- **PRISMATIC THOUGHT**

- **ORGANISATIONAL LEARNING & TRANSFORMATION**

- **SYSTEMIC EVALUATION**

BOUNDARY JUDGEMENTS

- Shift from problems, solutions and normal organisational life
- People, purposes and interacting issues emerging in conflict and /or cooperation
- Draw tentative boundaries around stakeholders, focussing on xxx, raising issues and dilemmas
- The boundaries define the action area
- Who is inside and benefits from it
- Who is outside and does not
- What are the consequences?
- How do we feel about that
- Boundaries are temporary and partial

DEEPENING SYSTEMIC APPRECIATION

- Opening four windows on the action area
- Systems of Processes (efficiency and reliability)
- Systems of Structures (effectiveness)
- Systems of meaning (agreements etc)
- Systems of knowledge-power
- (emancipating the privileged and unshackling the underprivileged)
- Prismatic thought ✞ options for action

Organisational Learning and Transformation

- (Using learning scenarios and systemic evaluation
- ✝   First scenario learns in the context of the future we might be heading for
- ✝   Second scenario learns about ideal futures
- ✝   Third scenario learns of ways to close the gap i.e. ways to move to ideal system properties or to shift the boundaries

All three scenarios are continually revisited

✝Systemic evaluation of issues and dilemmas of systems of processes, structures, meaning and knowledge-power, indicates performance of projects in these terms

✝ Provides information for reflection on and change where necessary

✝Seek balance between instrumental action and experimental action.

SLA applied to Guyana

- **Assets analysis:**
- **Human Capital : Severely eroded internally (ex: transcription services) ,is the diaspora a possible asset**
- **Social capital : weak , high levels of distrust low levels of confidence in political system, police force ,judicial system enforceability of contracts**
- **Natural capital : abundant**
- **Physical and Economic :Weak.**
- **Applying the SLA at Success Village**

Multi-level Vulnerability Analysis in Guyana

- **Individuals: Physical and economic security**
- **Groups : as above + crises of identity, trust, shared vision , leadership**
- **Local Government : Lack of capacity , resources , capture of public institutions for partisan interest……..**
- **National Government as above +revenue leakages, border disputes, macro-economics, commodity prices , debt management, politics**
- **Regional /International/ Global**

Bibliography

- UNDP (2001)Review of UNDP governance experience in special circumstances.

- Chua, Amy. 2003. The world on fire . How free market democracy breeds ethnic hatred and global instability.(Doubleday)

- Carothers ,Thomas.1999.Aiding democracy abroad. The learning curve. Carnegie.

- OECD .2001. DAC guidelines: Helping prevent violent conflict.

Bibliography cont'd

- Singh, Naresh. 2003. Governance for poverty eradication and sustainable development . Issues in international development co-operation. In Hall and Benn (eds): Governance in the age of globalization. Ian Randle Publishers.

- IDEA. 1998. Democracy and deep rooted conflict :Options for negotiators. IDEA.

- CIDA- FoF. 2003. Unpublished .

- Flood, .R.L. 2001. Rethinking the fifth discipline. Routledge.